THESIS PROJECT – BOOK PROPOSAL

Brand Aid for NGOs

A New Mission for NGOs to Advance Philanthropy Worldwide

L. Michelle
Professor: Forrest Inslee
Thesis Practicum II: GLST 5972/3001
25 April 2017

Some material included in this thesis was previously submitted to meet the requirements for the MAICD Course: Social Entrepreneurship.

Table of Contents

Foreword by the Author:

Brand Aid for NGOs is the result of my fieldwork as a graduate student pursuing a Master of Arts in International Community Development at Northwest University and a 20-year career in Public Relations and Strategic Communications. However, one could say it has been a life long undertaking just now coming to fruition. As a teenager, I was enthralled by the idea of traveling the world and meeting people from diverse cultures. In fact, when I first walked onto the campus of the University of Washington as a freshman, I thought I would be an International Studies major. Those plans shifted as I began taking Communications classes and found that I had a natural talent for Public Relations. In other words, my grades were far better in those classes. I took the practical course of action and declared my major in Communications. However, I did minor in Anthropology, which satisfied my desire to learn all I could about the world's peoples—at least through books and lectures. Traveling to far off places would have to wait.

Flash forward 20 years. I had successfully navigated my career in Communications and Public Relations working for an engineering company, a two-person Public Relations shop, an insurance firm, and finally as the Executive Director of Communications for two public school districts in Washington State. At last, I felt I had attained a circumstance that would allow me the time and financial resources to join a volunteer mission abroad. I got my opportunity in 2013 as a member of Rotary International on a humanitarian mission to perform cataract surgeries in the remote village of Dembi Dollo in Ethiopia. Of course, I thought I was selected to act in the capacity of project documentary videographer and storyteller. To my surprise, I was assigned to assist the nurses and surgeons in the operating room. I received this news after a two hour training session with the project surgeon at the Pacific Cataract and Laser Institute. I surmised

that my ability to watch a patient receive a numbing treatment with a long needle depressed into the eyeball without fainting, or flinching, made me more valuable in the operating room.

Of course, the actual operating room in the remote village of Dembi Dollo, Ethiopia was a far cry from the Laser Institute. While great care was taken to create a sterile operating environment, battle against germs was fierce and a large part of my job entailed running after flies with a spray bottle of bleach water. By the end of the second day, I was exhausted. Looking out at the sea of people gathered in front of the clinic, hundreds, many who had walked enormous distances for the chance to regain their sight, nearly overwhelmed me. However, by the end of the third day, we—the surgeons, nurses, and assistants—found our groove and our focus was solely on treating every last patient. There was no way we were going to turn anyone away knowing that a simple twenty minute surgery would restore their sight. Of course, I did sneak in some filming with a tiny handheld camera when I could. While I fussed over the poor sound and the shaky handheld quality of the camera, I did manage to create a decent video documenting the trip. This video was used to encourage other Rotary clubs to support future cataract surgery clinics in Ethiopia. The video, entitled "Dembi Dollo Ethiopia 2013 Eye Clinic," is still available on YouTube.

After returning from Ethiopia, I continued to hone my skills as a strategic communicator and storyteller, specializing in video and social media campaigns for public education. I was fortunate to have the opportunity to master my craft in the complex and highly political field that is the American public education system. I have always been a strong advocate for education because it is the key to unlocking the potential in every person. I like to dream about what the world would be like if every individual on the planet was free to reach for their own highest potential. It is this vision that fueled my desire to shift my focus away from public education in

the United States toward global development efforts. Basically, I decided it was time for me to be on the team working for the benefit of people suffering from poverty or denied access to education, human rights, or basic needs such as food, water, and proper sanitation.

I learned over the course of my research that the field of global development is now undergoing an intense time of change and transformation. The efficacy and ability of philanthropy and aid programs to solve our world's biggest problems is being questioned at the most fundamental level. This has led to many stating bluntly that aid does more harm than good. For some in the development community, this scrutiny is cause for a good deal of soul searching. What does it mean to be an NGO in this new era of globalization? How might a philanthropic organization redefine its mission to stay relevant with the times? Coming from a strategic communications background, I naturally look at these questions through that lens and a good portion of the book is devoted to ground level, cross-cultural communication strategies. At the bird's eye level, however, I see that NGOs, especially those based in the United States, have a tremendous opportunity right now to re-imagine their purpose, to rebrand themselves, if you will. I am not speaking about the design elements of branding such as choosing colors, fonts, and logos. Branding is, at its heart, about establishing the essence of an organization through a definitive statement about who they are, what they do, and most importantly, why they do it. It is now time for many NGOs to rebrand their mission. The time has come for a new, more democratic and cross-cultural vision to drive the work of global aid and philanthropy. It is my sincere hope that the information I have gathered through fieldwork, research, and numerous interviews will spark important, defining conversations among the leadership, staff, and communications professionals working for NGOs and philanthropic organizations in the United States. I am optimistic that by becoming more truly cross-cultural and collaborative, these

organizations will be in a position to support the innovative approaches to development work springing up in countries all around the world. We are on the verge of telling one of the most important stories in our collective history: the story of how we the people, from all nations and all creeds, finally learned how to work together—the story of how we created a world in which every person has the opportunity to achieve their highest potential and live their lives to the fullest.

L. Michelle

Seattle, Washington

4/25/2017

SECTION I: MAKING THE CASE TO EXPAND PHILANTHROPY AND FUNDRAISE IN OTHER COUNTRIES

Summary: Section I presents the thesis of the book, calling for change in the practices of NGOs and philanthropic organizations. It includes an analysis of the changing landscape of global aid and philanthropy and visible signs of change already underway in approaches to development work worldwide.

Introduction: The Way of the Dinosaur

The global economic crisis of 2007-2008 may go down in history as the event that ended the economic dominance of the West and ushered in a new approach to foreign aid and international development work. The economic crisis brought to the world's attention an already trending shift of wealth from the west to the east and the emergence of a new middle class dominance in Asia. Historically, NGO fundraising efforts have been focused on raising contributions from the wealthy middle class in the United States, western Europe and Scandanavia. However, The International Monetary Fund (IMF) suggests China will be the world's largest economy by 2050 followed by the U.S., India, Europe, Brazil, Russia, Japan, Mexico, Indonesia, and the United Kingdom. As Cluff and Guillet de Monthoux point out, by ignoring the growing economic dominance of Asia, the booming population growth in China and India, and the stagnant growth of both population and wealth in Europe and United States, "… fundraisers could carry on what they have done for decades, addressing the same audiences, and expecting similar results, without really registering the change the world is going through" (6023-6399). From a simple market-driven perspective, NGO fundraising operations ought to be pushing into these new markets. Even prior to the economic crisis, countries such as China,

India, and Brazil had themselves become the donors of foreign aid with their own interests abroad. In effect, the economic crisis simply hastened a democratization of aid systems already under way.

In March of 2017, United States President, Donald Trump, added to the storm, announcing a proposed 31% cut in State Department funding for the U.S. Agency for International Development (Schwartz). NGOs and other development agencies are left to determine how these budget and staffing cuts will affect their funding and ability to deliver programs. This uncertainty comes on the heels of a backlash from governments concerned about the ideological influence of US foreign aid that has prompted countries to adopt policies barring their local nonprofit organizations from accepting foreign aid dollars. According to a 2014 article in *The Economist,* Azerbaijan, Mexico, Pakistan, Russia, Sudan and Venezuela have all passed such laws, with other countries including Bangladesh, Egypt, Malaysia and Nigeria following suit. According to *The Economist*, "NGOs focused on democracy-building or human rights are the most affected, but the crackdown is also hitting those active in other areas, such as public health" ("Donors"). These government actions may succeed in thwarting U.S. political objectives, but have little to do with improving the lives of the people in those countries. NGOs must not give up their work in these countries, but instead redouble their efforts to either earn the trust and partnership of governments or to assist the people to reduce their reliance on government to address social challenges.

Regardless of economic dominance, funding uncertainty, or the actions of other governments, a growing consensus is building in the development community that the traditional aid model is an ineffective long term strategy that often perpetuates the problems it is attempting to solve. It is a vertical, paternalistic model that, despite many a mission statement, does not lead

to the empowerment of the individuals it serves. Perhaps the most telling signal of a new age for NGOs is the announcement made in 2016 by the Oxford, England-based development giant, Oxfam, that it will relocate its global headquarters to Nairobi following similar moves by Amnesty International and Action Aid. Oxfam's International Executive Director Winnie Byanyima asserts that the move from the global north to the global south is about "working alongside citizens and supporting them to work for change" (Moorehead and Clark). This is a more horizontal, fraternal approach to the work that needs to be done in these countries.

Amidst this changing landscape of foreign aid, NGOs based in the United States must begin to broaden their fundraising and donor development strategies. It is time NGOs consider the benefit and opportunity of diversifying efforts and fostering the emergence of philanthropy and donor development within the countries they serve. The old paradigm of fundraising at home in the U.S. to support work abroad is no longer a guarantee. There is an untapped wealth and interest in philanthropy in emerging and middle income countries, especially among their business communities, that may be leveraged into new sources of revenue for programs. A further consideration is that in the next decade countries like Indonesia and India will start to outgrow the need for foreign government aid altogether. NGOs should be thinking about what these countries need to have in place in order to cover the cost of what aid brings them now. Part of that solution is a thriving philanthropic sector.

The question then becomes how to go about developing this philanthropic sector. Facing reductions in funding and increased interest in sustainable economic development approaches, such as microfinance, the truth is that some NGOs may not survive this transitory period. Others may need to redefine their missions or adopt a page out of the social enterprise playbook and reinvent themselves as the suppliers of philanthropic expertise to other nations. Rather than

delivering aid programs, NGOs may instead focus on providing on-the-ground education and technical expertise to local nonprofit and community organizations. This is certainly not to suggest that this type of work is not already being performed by many NGOs. Instead, it is to suggest that it will likely be a greater area of focus as NGOs adapt to reduced funding for traditional aid programs. NGOs may need to adopt a startup business mentality and consider opening small offices in middle income or developing countries and marketing their philanthropic expertise to the local community. NGOs have to their advantage the personal and business relationships they have cultivated abroad and all they have learned about what is meaningful and motivating from their point of view. Even so, NGOs should prepare to make investments to train local talent who naturally possess the necessary language skills and nuanced cultural understanding to perform vital fundraising campaigns in their countries. NGOs already possess tremendous expertise in developing effective fundraising and awareness campaigns in the United States. The strategic effort involved is to pivot to non-American audiences with appealing stories, symbols, and messages with that expertise. With an entrepreneurial attitude and a focus on producing culturally relevant messaging and storytelling, NGOs are capable of unleashing the power of philanthropy in societies around the world as well as engaging millions of potential donors. Possible strategies for NGOs to support philanthropy around the world will be discussed in depth in Section III. Section I will set the stage by offering new ideas about philanthropy and a survey of efforts already underway in many nations. Section II will offer an exploration of the motivations or structural reasons for giving—or not giving—in various cultures and countries to inform our strategies.

CHAPTER 1- CURRENT PHILANTHROPIC EFFORTS OUTSIDE OF THE US AND EUROPE

NEW IMAGES OF PHILANTHROPY

When we use the word "philanthropist," many of us envision a wealthy man or woman over the age of 60 who made his or her millions in corporate America. Perhaps we think of Bill Gates or Warren Buffet. What if we instead pictured a 40 year old woman of Hispanic descent who works at the florist shop or a black male in his 30's who is an aspiring Disc Jockey? Even within the United States, we are beginning to recognize that we have excluded people from philanthropy due to their cultural heritage, age, or socioeconomic background. This is truly an injustice. As Alfre Woodard asks us to understand, "Giving isn't a posture reserved for the rich or powerful. It is the responsibility and privilege of every man, woman, and child to participate in the task of building more just and humane societies. The concept of justice [is] too often excluded from philanthropy" (Joyaux 456). Through this lens, philanthropy is about empowerment for social change that fills lives with purpose and dignity. No one ought to be excluded from that joy due to their economic or cultural background.

It was from Scott Jackson, CEO at Alexandria, VA-based Global Impact, that I first heard the term "democratizing philanthropy." Global Impact was formed 60 years ago as a federation of international nonprofits to tap into large workplace giving campaigns, similar to the United Way. Global Impact serves more than 130 INGOs in 500 campaigns every year, raising upwards of $110 million annually. The organization is making philanthropy accessible to everyone through Growfund, which is a platform Global Impact has developed that allows an individual to create a donor-advised fund with a minimum of $1.00 to open the account. In effect, anyone can create a personal foundation in which to invest their own money as well as accept donations from others, allow their investments to grow, and then grant money to the more than 800,000

registered nonprofit organizations. What makes this groundbreaking is that this donor-advised fund does not require the historic account minimum of $5,000 to open. Global Impact has devised an inclusive tool that invites everyone to see themselves as philanthropists and participate in a meaningful way. Imagine how a tool of this nature, marketed in developing and middle income countries, could change the landscape of philanthropic giving. This type of technical solution is a win-win in that, over time, has the potential to change people's beliefs about their capacity to give as well as build a new donor base for NGOs.

However, this more democratic, for-all vision of philanthropy is not new. For centuries, giving on the African continent has not been based on wealth, but a sense of responsibility for others in need. In South Africa, this is called *Ubuntu*. In modern times, things like environmental cleanups, participating with community-based organizations, or organizing fundraisers for health care or the education of individuals are simply part of one's responsibility as a member of the community. These tasks are not considered a charitable giving of time or talent in the same way they are in the United States. It is important to recognize that the western style of philanthropy that Africans are sometimes exposed to with the NGOs in their communities is at odds with their giving culture. For example, NGOs have staff members who are paid to do their work. They do not work out of Ubuntu. South Africans see NGO personnel with nice cars and operating with what appear to be huge budgets and mission statements as things that do not fit within Ubuntu philosophy. For an NGO attempting to garner support from South Africans, it is important to realize that this is not only a culturally foreign version of charity, but it does little to convince people they ought to share their limited monetary resources with the NGO (Muchilwa 3981-90).

That said, there is absolutely a movement underway in Africa toward more formalized philanthropy, although it is still community-centric. The African Philanthropy Network (APN)

published an 84-page report in 2013 citing research conducted by Dahlberg Research and Global Development Advisors that claimed their analysis had identified a substantial new pool of potential philanthropists. However, the giving patterns of these individuals tended to lack strategy, favored informal giving, and displayed a tendency to avoid giving to institutions to sidestep scrutiny (Sizing The Field). The APN is actively working to address these issues from all angles and held its first global summit on philanthropy in December 2016. The summit, attended by representatives from community foundations, women's funds, environmental funds, and grassroots fundraising organizations was structured around the theme "Shift The Power" to underscore the importance of community giving in the development process. As Jenny Hogdson, the Executive Director of the Global Fund for Community Foundations observed, "These institutions form an important part of the growing sector of organized philanthropy in parts of the world traditionally regarded as beneficiary rather than donor countries" ("Community"). Further, because these community philanthropy institutions involve multiple stakeholders, they tend to promote citizen participation and create localized cultures of giving by people of all economic levels, rather than just the wealthy ("Community").

New Players on the Field

Philanthropy is clearly undergoing a process of democratization as people around the world seek to solve problems in their own communities using philanthropic means. We have already touched on new approaches coming out of Africa in the form of community philanthropy. However, there are many approaches occurring all over the world and I do encourage any NGO or international development or foundation leader to read *Global Fundraising: How the World is Changing the Rules of Philanthropy* by Penelope Cagney and Bernard Ross for an eye-opening and comprehensive survey of government aid initiatives as well

as private and corporate philanthropy worldwide. For our purposes, a brief look at South Korea and Latin America offer examples of emerging global trends and new players in the field of development work.

South Korea, once a recipient of foreign aid, is now advancing its own social change initiatives. According to Kongdan Oh, a nonresident senior fellow at the Brookings Institution, despite experiencing better jobs, living conditions, and economic success, Koreans had "a kind of 'me first' syndrome… showing itself in pushing and shoving and the frequent resort to corruption to get ahead" in the 1990s (Oh). Over time, as Koreans began to feel more secure in their success, the country began to look outward. In 2010, Korea became the first member of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) to transform its status from recipient to donor. Korea's outreach is evident in its participation in the security and reconstruction efforts in Afghanistan, disaster relief in Haiti and Indonesia, and donations to public health centers in Ecuador and Colombia (Oh). Perhaps most interesting is the launch of its own version of the Peace Corps under an umbrella government program called World Friends. These volunteer ambassador programs focus on a particular area of expertise. The Korean Internet Volunteers, as an example, offer internet communication training to students in 40 countries. According to Oh, the objective of these ambassador programs is to improve the quality of life for people in the host nations, strengthen friendship and mutual understanding, and help the volunteers fulfill their own potential. Oh relates that "like members of the American Peace Corps and similar volunteer organizations in other countries, volunteers often discover their overseas experience has become a defining part of their life and a path to future success in their careers back home" (Oh).

Shifting to Latin America, we start by noting that most Latin American countries use the term Private Social Investment, rather than philanthropy to describe the distribution of private resources for social justice or social change. Philanthropy in Latin America is viewed as a short-term solution more akin to humanitarian relief. On the other hand, private social investment is associated with sustainability, measurable impact, empowerment, innovation, and risk taking ("Challenges"). It is important to keep this distinction of terminology in mind when cooperating with Latin American countries. Up until the last decade, most of this private social investment was the result of giving through wealthy family foundations. However, since 2010, corporate foundations in Latin America have proliferated and are emerging as a new dominant force in private social investment. There are now four associations in operation to support to corporate foundations and corporate social responsibility (CSR) initiatives, including the Mexican Center for Philanthropy, the Association of Corporate Foundations in Columbia and the Group of Institutes, Foundations and Corporations in Brazil and Argentina ("Ten Things").

This shift to Corporate Social Responsibility in Latin America tracks with a growing global trend of expectation that the business community ought to invest in social change and social good, as opposed to wealth distribution occurring solely or even mainly within the domain of government. Consider Carlos Slim Helu, known as Carlos Slim, one of the richest persons in the world who controls Latin America's largest mobile telecom firm, America Movil, and Mexico's only phone company, Telmex. The son of Lebanese immigrants to Mexico, Slim made his fortune investing in mining and real estate, making well-timed acquisitions of companies such as Reynolds Aluminum, and acquiring Mexican rights to US brands such as Hershey's and Firestone Tires (Velez). Slim is famously quoted as scoffing both Bill Gates and Warren Buffet for "going around like Santa Claus trying to cure society's ills" and stating that " poverty isn't

solved with donations" but rather through business and job creation (Laughlin). However, as Slim's wealth continued to rise and attract more international attention, "Slim has poured billions into a previously neglected aspect of his business: corporate social responsibility" (Laughlin). By 2016, Forbes Magazine had declared that "Slim is fast developing as one of the foremost philanthropists outside the U.S." and is reported to have contributed $8 billion in charitable giving through his foundations (Estevez). While we can only speculate on Slim's motivations, it seems likely that a general climate of expectation that corporations participate philanthropically for the social good would have factored into his contributions. Additional examples of Corporate Social Responsibility will be discussed in Chapter Eight, The Business of Philanthropy. Taking into account these new images and new players for social change emerging in different forms around the world, we now turn to a closer examination of the motivations for giving as well as structural issues that affect philanthropic efforts outside of the United States.

SECTION II. MOTIVATIONS FOR GIVING AND STRUCTURAL ISSUES OUTSIDE THE U.S.

Summary: Section II is intended to create a foundation of understanding about how philanthropy is currently viewed and experienced in other cultures as a basis for the strategies covered in Section III.

CHAPTER 2 – PERSONAL MOTIVATIONS

Chapter Summary: Chapter Two builds on research conducted by Russ Alan Prince and Karen Maru File in the *Seven Faces of Philanthropy* that sought to categorize the personal motivations of high net worth philanthropic donors in the United States. Using examples from Mexico, Africa, India, and Afghanistan, this chapter adds a cultural lens to the question of personal motivations to illustrate varying attitudes toward, and reasons for, charitable giving.

CHAPTER 3 – RELIGIOUS MOTIVATIONS

Chapter Summary: Philanthropy and religion share a long common history. Chapter Three primarily focuses on philanthropy within Islamic cultures. Historical attitudes and traditions are touched upon, however the emphasis is on recent examples of Islamic philanthropy and what some researchers term "Pious Neoliberalism." This chapter is not meant to be a conclusive or exhaustive review of religious motivations, but rather to serve as another reference point from which to develop strategies for communication and collaboration.

CHAPTER 4 – STRUCTURAL AND GOVERNANCE ISSUES

Chapter Summary: Chapter Four draws on examples from various practitioners and researchers regarding the challenges NGOs often face when attempting to foster philanthropy or raise funds in other countries. NGOs, both domestic and foreign, often face complicated regulations or laws that prohibit them from operating in certain countries. The chapter is meant

to concede that these challenges exist. It is also meant to inspire creative and strategic thinking in addressing these challenges.

III. STRATEGIES TO SUPPORT PHILANTHROPY

Summary: Section III offers practical advice gleaned from dozens of interviews with CEOs and communications professionals from a wide range of NGOs. This is the "how to" portion of the book that examines strategies to support the philanthropic efforts underway in other countries, how to work with the business community and social entrepreneurs, tap into youth culture, and develop effective fundraising and awareness campaigns for cross-cultural audiences through storytelling and social media.

CHAPTER 6 —CROSS CULTURAL MESSAGING – PREPARING THE GROUNDWORK

Many readers will be familiar with the groundbreaking work of Dutch researcher Geert Hofstede from 1963-1977. Hofstede developed a cultural dimension index that ordered cultures along a continuum of dimensions, including individualism, masculinity, uncertainty avoidance, long-term orientation, and indulgence (Hofstede 742). Hofstede's work, and that of his colleagues at the Hofstede Centre, provides a relevant framework for cross-cultural relations that is, to this day, an important resource for international relations and business. Erin Meyer, a professor at the INSEAD international business school has expanded on these ideas in her book *Culture Map: Breaking Through the Invisible Boundaries of Global Busness*. Of particular importance to our discussion on communicating, she introduces the concept of low and high context conversations. Meyer claims, "High-context cultures tend to have a long shared history. Usually they are relationship-oriented societies where networks of connections are passed on from generation to generation, generating more shared context among community members" (39). By contrast, Americans have shared a short history and that history has been shaped by our

immigrant heritage of people from different cultural backgrounds. Due to this lack of shared context, Americans learned to be as explicit as possible, and this often results in our tendency to repeat things over and over. If one repeats oneself several times in a high context culture, one may be mistaken for being condescending or talking to a person as if he or she were a child (41-42). Americans are not known for being subtle and that is important to keep in mind as we adapt our fundraising and awareness campaign messaging in other countries.

Further, as Dawn Burton cautions in *Cultural Marketing*, we must be aware of our own implicit biases or cultural norms and how those are embedded in our messaging. For example, family life is a major theme used by retailers in their advertising. However, what constitutes a family is often viewed differently in various cultures. In the United States, the nuclear family is still the prevailing model, and while that model is broadening to one- and two-person households, we do not generally include the extended family. Burton suggests that this is a very different scenario to the Indian subcontinent, the Middle East, and Far East, where extended families comprising grandparents and aunts and uncles are still common (242-243). The key takeaways from this example are to become as informed as possible about the cultures we are working with and always start with a self-check in an attempt to become aware of the assumptions, norms, and biases we possess.

While resources such as *Cultural Marketing* and *Culture Map* provide valuable information about other cultures, the best strategy is to cultivate relationships with cultural mentors. Cultural mentors can assist in interpreting what is said, what is heard, what is meant, and what is implied in the nuances of language and other symbols. An NGO may even decide to employ communications staff in the countries it serves. This strategy is underway at the World Resources Institute (WRI), through the opening of satellite offices in Indonesia, Brazil, Africa,

and China. According to Laura Dooley, Online Communications Director at WRI, "One of the reasons that [WRI] opened the satellite offices is because the people there do know how to navigate the culture. We started with research staff and now we are trying to build the communications staff" (Dooley). However, supporting satellite offices may not be an easy task. For example, there has been some tension at WRI as they have attempted to maintain brand identity with the communications materials produced in its satellite offices (Dooley). NGOs may need to develop a process of oversight that protects brand identity while allowing franchises the leeway they need to create culturally relevant messaging.

Case Study: Logo On a Theme of Solidarity, Yardimlasma ve Dayanisma Vakfi

The Yardimlasma ve Dayanisma Vakfi (YDV) located in Istanbul, works to supply the more than two million Syrian refugees currently living in that city with food, clothing, and medicine. The organization is also working to secure funding as well as support from local educators for Turkish language programs for Syrian children so they may continue their education in Turkish schools. My contact at YDV was founder Mine Yildirum, a scholar, Christian, and activist for religious freedom in Turkey. At the time of my fieldwork experience, the foundation needed assistance developing their branding materials and online presence. One of their primary goals with their marketing efforts was to grow local awareness of their foundation and position themselves to obtain grant dollars from Turkish and international granting organizations. Yildirum also expressed a desire to get the people of her country more engaged in charitable giving, making financial contributions to organizations like YDV. As discussed in Chapter Three, Islam, the religion practiced by the majority of Turkish people, has long-standing traditions of philanthropy. According to Barbara Lethem Ibrahim of the Gerhart Center for Philanthropy at the American University of Cairo, a common pattern in Islamic

charity is to give to causes that address immediate aid for the needy in their community (Ibrahim). Therefore, a viable strategy to leverage Islamic giving traditions in this case would be to extend the boundary of the community in the minds of Turkish citizens to include the Syrian refugees who are in need of immediate aid.

Yardimlasma ve Dayanisma Vakfi roughly translates to Assistance and Solidarity Foundation in English. In my experience as a consumer of fundraising appeals, the word "solidarity" is not one I see typically used by nonprofits or NGOs based in the United States, especially in their fundraising messages or mission statements. More common are words like "unity" or "stand together." Perhaps this is because the symbols and uses of the word solidarity in the U.S. have often been associated with resistance and defiance, as well as the civil rights and labor union movements. Solidarity may also evoke images of the Cold War and Communism. Because of this, the term is more likely to be used to galvanize people around causes or mass protests. However, it may not appeal to broad audiences who do not associate with violence or disruption. In eastern European countries neighboring Turkey, the term solidarity is more commonly used in messaging and it speaks to the idea of the people creating social bonds as opposed to isolating themselves from others. For example, the European Federation of Local Solidarity states that it systematically leads information campaigns to embed the values of citizenship, brotherhood, and tolerance in European society and sponsors an annual "Neighbor Day" event held each May in 36 countries ("European Neighbors"). Here, solidarity has a feeling of reaching across social, cultural, religious and political barriers to create cohesion with people outside of one's identity group. It could be between one's family and a neighbor's family, one country and another country, or, in this case, a resident of Istanbul and a Syrian refugee.

As an American developing a logo for a Turkish audience, I knew enough to ask if there were particular colors I should stay away from, as colors are often used to identify with a certain social group or nationality. I was told that a combination of yellow, green, and red would be inappropriate and, in fact, we ought to avoid primary colors altogether. Many flags in the Middle East use this color scheme and given the nature of YDV's work, it made sense not to evoke this sense of countries and borders. We settled on navy and magenta. I asked Yildirum if there was a logo she and her team liked that I could use as a model. Indeed, there was, and it was the logo of an organization based in New York, Every Mother Counts, which provided the look and feel they were after. See Figure 1.

Fig. 1. Every Mother Counts Logo from organization website, "Every Mother Counts." Every Mother Counts. N.p., n.d. Web. 07 July 2016.

As stated above, we felt the concept of solidarity was clearly important to express, even though it was part of the organization's name. A search for "universal symbols for solidarity" turned up, among many raised fists, symbols like the one shown in Figure 2.

Fig. 1. A visual symbol of solidarity from "Our First Universal Solidarity Symbol!" Universal Solidarity. N.p., 07 Apr. 2013. Web. 19 July 2016.

Having seen so many logos both photo realistic and illustrated with connecting hands, to my eyes, this kind of image seemed a little bit stale. I enlisted the help of graphic designer Melissa Johnson, and we set to work to create and innovate an appropriate design. The first draft of the logo featured white lines connecting from different paths to imply this image of hands

crossing and connecting. The heart symbol, although perhaps just as clichéd as the hands, seemed appropriate to suggest the caring work that YDV was doing with the Syrian Refugees and the Christian concept of Love Thy Neighbor. The heart also reflected the tenderness that I perceived in the Every Mother Counts logo. Figure 3 shows the first iteration:

Fig. 3. First YDV logo prototype. Michelle, L. and Melissa Johnson. Graphic Logo Rendering. 08 Aug. 2016.

The feedback was, in typical Turkish fashion, direct. Wrote Yildirum in an email, "We love the colors and style. We are wondering if the heart in the centre can be changed with a symbol implying solidarity, for example hands reaching to one another " (Yildirum). Apparently the solidarity suggestion was too subtle in that first draft. We tried a different direction, literally trying to change the heart into a more obvious symbol of solidarity, still resisting the visual of four hands connecting. See Figure 4.

Fig. 4. Second YDV logo prototype. Michelle, L. and Melissa Johnson. Graphic Logo Rendering. 11 Aug. 2016.

The response was that they really liked the first one, except for the heart. We realized that they really did mean that the heart needed to go completely. Perhaps the heart symbol seemed inappropriately emotional or personal in this context. I did not ask at the time, but I absolutely should have done so to gain that cultural insight. We replaced the heart with two hands, and after deciding to use a more modern font and brightening the color palette a bit, we had our final logo as shown in Figure 5.

Fig. 5. Second YDV logo prototype. Michelle, L. and Melissa Johnson. Graphic Logo Rendering. 14 Aug. 2016.

As anyone who has designed logos knows, regardless of cultural differences, creating logos is a process that includes much back and forth communication and tweaks and trials as people attempt to communicate a "look" or "feel." However, working through the extra layer of cultural context makes the process even more engaging and interesting if one is open to listening and learning what is appropriate and meaningful to that culture. I learned to look at solidarity more broadly than I had been conditioned to in my personal cultural experience.

Interestingly, I would soon have an opportunity to witness the word solidarity regain popularity in response to the 2016 Brexit vote in the United Kingdom and the anti-immigration policies of the newly elected President of the United States, Donald Trump in early 2017. The safety pin has become a new symbol and these expressions of solidarity do have that essence of resisting isolationism and reaching across ideological barriers to acknowledge our social bonds with those who are not our own social group, culture, or nationality. See Figure 6.

Fig. 6. "Safety Pin Solidarity Meme." Snopes.com. N.p, 19 Nov. 2016. Web. 06 Feb. 017.

Solidarity in this sense echoes the ancient tenet of offering hospitality to strangers. Richard Beck, author of *Unclean: Meditations on Purity, Hospitality, and Mortality,* offers this reflection:

> Our natural instincts assure us that humanity ends at the border of our tribe… beyond those borders are strangers and monsters… our feelings toward these outsiders range from blank indifference, to disgust, to contempt, to hatred… hospitality is the fight against these impulses… a deep psychological struggle… to make room for others within the borders of my own selfhood. (Beck 139)

In her book *Resisting Structural Evil: Love as Ecological-Economic Vocation,* professor and environmental activist Cynthia Moe-Loebeda similarly approaches the concept of solidarity in the form of "neighbor-love" described as a love that ignores social boundaries. Recounting the parable of the Good Samaritan, Moe-Loebeda explains that the neighbor who served the wounded person in that story is an "outsider," a Samaritan, and thus not a member of the community. Jesus' call to love your enemy, Moe-Loebeda states, "makes very clear that the love to which we are called extends beyond the boundaries of 'my people'" (177). The concepts of hospitality and the Good Samaritin would emerge again in the course of my research, this time in Afghanistan, which we will pick up in the chapter on Youth Philanthropy.

CHAPTER 7 – METHODS OF MARKETING PHILANTHROPY CROSS-CULTURALLY

STORYTELLING AND SOCIAL MEDIA

Storytelling is at the heart of all great awareness campaigns, but for an NGO working to solve enormous societal challenges, storytelling needs to be more than a campaign vehicle. It needs to be an essential part of everything they do. Global Impact CEO Scott Jackson went so far as to say that the development community must think about their profession primarily as storytellers. Jackson asserted, "Our ability to connect the story of self to the story of us is absolutely essential. Whether we are involved in thought leadership or fundraising, we believe

we have to be storytelling" (Jackson). Today, technology has enabled unprecedented opportunities for foundations and NGOs working to solve our planet's most dire problems to tell these stories to a global audience. This chapter focuses on the art of storytelling, drawing on the experience of people in the field on how to deliver those stories in a meaningful way to cross-cultural audiences and leverage social media wisely to distribute those stories.

The power of the story is its ability to reach us and to teach us. The stories that we remember, no matter our cultural heritage, are the ones that we connect with personally, the ones with a moral lesson or the ones that taught us something new. Laura Aslia, Vice President of Public Affairs at New York-based International Trade and Development organization, Pyxera Global, contended that the ultimate in storytelling is a well-framed photograph. As Aslia explained, "Great stories have a protagonist, a struggle, and a happy ending. All of this may be distilled into a single image or photograph, and it is this narrative that is most important for our work. Information can build a case for action, but data and statistics do not change minds. Stories, empathy, and that spark of understanding need to happen first" (Aslia). There is no question that an image that tells a story has the power to change everything. In early 2015, it was difficult for organizations such as the International Rescue Committee to raise money for Syrian refugees. No one in the United States was paying much attention to the humanitarian crisis happening on the other side of the world. How could so many people have been apathetic or unaware of the massive refugee crisis? One explanation is that such overwhelming tragedy is difficult for one person to wrap his or her mind around. While in our hearts we know any attempt to resolve such a tragedy should be supported, we feel helpless to make a difference. However, when brought down to a single point in time, one human and one story, many people find in themselves the will to act. When the image of a drowned Syrian boy washed up on the coast of

Bodrum, Turkey began flashing on television, computer, and mobile device screens, a chord was struck that got people's attention and elicited an outpouring of support. See Figures 7 and 8. What motivates people are stories that allow them to connect on a human level. Beyond any strategic communications plan or social media campaign, an NGO or development organization that embraces this truth will have the greatest success in its outreach efforts.

Fig. 7. Image of Aylan Kurdi, one of 12 Syrians drowned attempting to find refuge in Greece. "End Bloodshed, Appeals Aylan's Father." Arab News. Arab News, 01 Sept. 2016. Web. 15 Feb. 2017.

Fig. 8. Example of Twitter post from the UN Refugee Agency. "The Boy in the Sand." UN Refugee Agency. N.p., 12 Sept. 2016. Twitter. 15 Feb 2017.

WHOSE LINE IS IT ANYWAY?

As storytellers, we can get easily get caught up in our own biases or preconceptions about the story we want to tell. As author Bryant L. Myers observes in *Walking With The Poor: Principals of Transformational Devopment*, "Helping people learn how to decode and demystify their social systems… is hard work because our own culture and worldview keep getting in the way. We are subtly tempted to help them see our view of their situation" (5166-5168). If we do not address this tendency to distort reality, we lessen the potential impact of our work with non-

American or non-Western audiences. I spoke to Crystaline Randazzo, a videographer, film producer, and one of the founders of *NGO Storytelling* on location in Nepal, about the importance of engaging the subject of the story in the creation and editing process to help counter those biases. Randazzo, who is regularly hired by NGOs to produce their campaign videos, described the customary process as, "We go, we collect stories, we come home, we edit them, we put them out into the world. There is never a secondary phase where we go back to the beneficiary and ask, 'What do you think about this story?'" (Randazzo). It is important for filmmakers and storytellers to keep in mind that they are representing people, not abstract concepts. It is essential to be open to telling the story in a way that represents the subject's point of view. As Randazzo pointed out, too often NGOs fall into the trap of predetermining the story, when on the ground something very different, but just as compelling, may be happening.

Involving the beneficiaries is not only the right thing to do, it makes for more compelling stories and it is possible to do without a huge investment in resources. Randazzo gave the example of Kate Lord, with the organization She's First, whose work routinely involves the girls she films in the editing process. Kate has worked in Nepal, Southeast Asia, China, and Africa and uses smartphones to deliver video via Facebook or WhatsApp. After Kate produces a video, she sends it to the girls so they can watch it and message their comments back. Including the subject in the review process does not cost additional financial resources, but it does require additional time to be factored into the production schedule. Randazzo explained, "You have to allow time to send it, have them receive it and message you back while allowing for the fact that some of them do not have Facebook or Internet access on a daily basis" (Randazzo). That said, for the NGO attempting to develop cross cultural marketing campaigns, this investment in time to involve the subject in the process seems a must.

This brings us back to the value of enlisting cultural mentors and talking to experts on the ground who can help make sure we are pitching a story in a way that people understand. Randazzo said this is a big problem for organizations that are used to working strictly with Western cultures. NGOs cannot assume that they can make a video, put it out, and that people will understand the story. To be successful, NGO storytellers need to understand the value system of their audience in order to present the story in a way that motivates them to act or to feel something. Randazzo counseled that organizations need to come in with a mindset of being students, not specialists, and learn how to apply all the things that are discovered in the field in the stories they create. When NGOs develop storytelling skills that focus on individual human impact stories authentic to the culture and told from their frame of reference, the NGO increases its ability to inspire action with those audiences.

Engaging the community authentically about the challenges they are experiencing also invites brand affinity and builds trust. According to Kiri Leroux Miller, author of *Content Marketing for Nonprofits: A Communications Map for Engaging Your Community, Becoming a Favorite Cause, and Raising More Money,* nonprofits should strive to become a donor's favorite organization. Why is this important? Benchmark studies conducted by Charity Dynamics and the Nonprofit Technology Network reveal that while supporters will often donate to multiple charities in a year, two thirds of their annual donations are given to a favorite charity and those supporters are more likely to become champions of that organization's cause (1245). Fundraising in other countries will be more successful for the NGO that has earned trust and brand affinity with diverse cultural audiences.

Collaboration is another key element in developing successful cross cultural campaigns. As Randazzo observed, "Every community I have ever worked with knew the problems they

were facing and how to address those problems. The idea that nonprofits and their employees have the solutions is outdated. The best solutions can be found through the collaboration of community and nonprofit" (Randazzo). This idea of collaboration directly applies to developing the story as well. Making the organization the hero of the story is a common pitfall. Stories are often so focused on the good work that the organization has done that the donor is literally left out of the picture. But let us say, for the sake of argument, that an organization *does* make a point of including the donor in the story, perhaps placing them in the context of the hero. When we are attempting to make a potential donor feel like a hero in a culture we are not familiar with, we need to understand how to elicit that emotional response. In one culture, eliciting a sense of having done one's duty to the community may make someone feel like a hero, in another, perhaps one is a hero for championing religious values, in another, eliciting a sense of empowerment to solve problems makes a person feel like a hero. Of course, individual motivations vary widely in any culture. However, there are always themes, words, and symbols that are well understood by most members of any group. Cultural guides and mentors can advise us how to frame stories in a contextually relevant and more effective way.

Platform Diving

Social media is a wonderful platform for storytelling, particularly through images. However, the immediacy and ease of social media tools may cause them to be used ineffectively. Often readers are bombarded with pictures and stories that are not fully developed or that contain a lot of statistics or information. To truly harness the power of storytelling through social media, strategy matters. Julie Urlaub, founder of Golden, Colorado-based Taiga Company, offers corporate communications and public relations for socially conscious brands and consults on strategy with her clients regularly. A storytelling approach Urlaub has found success with is

using social media to roll out a larger story in a series of daily episodes. Like an old-fashioned soap opera, it is possible to capture interest as people become invested in the story and want to find out how it pans out. Urlaub pointed out that this works, "because you engage [your audience] in such a way that a vested interest is created and they feel compelled to take action to make a donation or volunteer on their own" (Urlaub). However, Urlaub warned that "what doesn't work well is doing social media just for the sake of it [because] the end result is irrelevant or scattered content. There are plenty of examples of epic failures, poor results, and inefficiency resulting from a lack of strategy" (Urlaub). For example, a common pitfall is to jump on popular culture trends on social media without thinking it through. When National Geographic launched its Nat Geo "Swap Prejudice for Knowledge" campaign, it was meant to connect with younger audiences and evoke empathy and promote tolerance. However, using Snapchat's Face Swap technology came across to many as offensive. See Figure 9.

Fig. 9. Example of an image from NatGeo Swap Prejudice for Knowledge Snapchat campaign. Monllos, Kristina. "National Geographic Just Did a Face Swap Ad Campaign and It's Very Weird Indeed." Adweek. Adweek, n.d. Web 05 Mar.2017.

As Kristina Monllos, writing for *Adweek* observed, the idea of using a popular Snapchat meme may have seemed like a solid approach to connect with Millennials. However, it backfired because of a lack of understanding about why Snapchat's Face Swap tool is popular. Explains Monllos, "People aren't swapping their faces because they want to see what it's like to be another person. They're swapping faces because it's funny. Trying to import meaning onto that is naïve" (Monllos). Unfortunately, the choice to use a social media gimmick ended up trivializing an

important message. The opportunity for misunderstanding is amplified further when campaigns are developed for audiences in unfamiliar cultures from our own. When designing a campaign, taking the time to involve cultural mentors in market research is a crucial step that will always be a sound investment of time.

It is also important to be clear about the intended outcome of social media storytelling. Carine Umuhumuza is the Senior Manager of Digital Communications in Washington, D.C. based Devex, a media platform, social enterprise, and recruiting service for the global development community. Umuhumuza consults regularly with major NGOs and corporations told me she likes to remind her clients, "Just because your hashtag trended does not mean people are informed" (Umuhumuza). She sees social media as a valuable tool to bring awareness of a situation or cause into the mainstream and to the attention of potential partners and collaborators. For instance, if a social media story gets picked up by a major media outlet like the New York Times, it may elevate the topic such that it becomes something discussed at major meetings in the United Nations.

A great example of leveraging social media to engage powerful partners is Nigera's Bring Back Our Girls Now campaign that was launched on Facebook and Twitter by Nigerian activists. The campaign was started to bring awareness of the kidnapping of 276 schoolgirls in Chibok, Nigeria by an extremist group known as Boko Haram and to pressure the Nigerian government to return the girls home. The campaign was able to reach Michelle Obama, Anne Hathaway, and Malala Yousafzai as well as garner major media attention. See Figure 10. Nearly 225,000 people follow the Bring Back Our Girls on Facebook. Sadly, it remains to be seen if this engagement sparks meaningful dialogue about what can be done about Boko Haram. Indeed, at the time of this writing, 196 of 276 girls are still in captivity or missing. However, the campaign

does illustrate the cross-cultural influence of social media as it empowers people around the world to voice what is happening to them.

Fig. 10. Image from Michelle Obama Twitter post using #BringBackOurGirls, shared by Rickey Smiley. Essex, Myeisha. "First Lady Michelle Obama Joins #BringBackOurGirls Movement by Tweeting Her Support." The Ricky Smiley Morning Show. N.p., 08 May 2014. Web. 08 Mar. 2017.

Carine Umuhumuza said Devex is working to support social media as a tool for cross cultural collaboration, noting that when working with social media in developing countries, it is important to keep in mind that people are mostly viewing on mobile phones and looking at text. Basic SMS platforms work best. Tweets, for example, may be sent by SMS or to Facebook Lite. Technical issues aside, social media is a relatively low-cost way to bring people together to work collaboratively at a time when global development is undergoing tremendous change. Without a doubt, a major concern facing NGOs today is diminishing financial resources. Crystalline Randazzo, who works internationally for numerous NGOs, said she has seen drastic cutbacks in funding from USAID and that the UK has cut back programs in their embassies overseas as well. While the US is still the biggest player in terms of funding, criteria are getting more strict. Randazzo stated that "It is getting more and more difficult for nonprofits to rely solely on grants" (Randazzo).

Global development as we know it is changing. Social entrepreneurs, NGOs, nonprofits, and corporations are coming together and the lines are beginning to blur. Yet, as Umuhumuza

has observed at Devex, all too frequently organizations on the ground whose missions complement each other literally do not talk to each other. This silo mentality extends not only to communication and collaborating, but to program delivery as well. At Devex the goal is to change the conversations happening in the hallways at NGOs. Umuhumuza said Devex staff are asking, "Are they [NGOs] talking about things differently, are we hearing them ask different questions, what are they monitoring, are they creating better programs because the people they are serving are at the table?" (Umuhumuza). Whether the goal is delivering more effective programs or social media campaigns that inspire action or charitable contributions from international audiences, NGOs that offer their expertise as the medium, rather than the message that travels along it, will become conduits for a tremendous expansion of ideas and solutions for positive social change.

Celebrities and Campaigns

Examples of celebrities lending their names to campaigns, becoming vocal advocates for social causes, or starting their own nonprofit organizations or foundations abound. This section is not meant to be a deep dive into celebrity activism, nor a discourse on the worthiness of the causes they choose to support, nor a discussion of the good or harm their actions create. Rather, it is meant to acknowledge the built-in affinity, identification, and trust people have with certain celebrities that primes people to be more empathetic and receptive to messages. It is this transmission of empathy that celebrities offer that is especially useful to the NGO fundraiser/storyteller who is attempting to connect with cross-cultural audiences. According to Carine Umuhumuza, reaching out to celebrities to add their image or voice to a cause is not a heavy ask in the age of social media. It requires little effort on his or her part to get involved and participate in social media platforms. However, with that ease, it is especially important to be

strategic about asking celebrities to be what I call an "empathy wire," especially with audiences outside the United States.

While American celebrities certainly enjoy popularity around the world, there is a high potential for misunderstandings to occur. Take for example American Rapper Jay-Z, who toured Africa in 2006 as part of a United Nations (UN) and MTV campaign to bring attention to the global water crisis. This effort that won him a UN Special Humanitarian Award at a private New York ceremony ("Jay-Z"). However, the story many did not hear is the local criticism against Jay-Z for inaccessibly high ticket prices for his concerts, as well as perceived snubs reported by local musician and Hiplife founder Reggie Rockstone who accused Jay-Z of refusing to meet with local musicians and sequestering himself in high style. According to Jesse Shipley in *Living the Hiplife: Celebrity and Entrepreneurship in Ghanian Popular Music,* "While at first the Ghanian media celebrated Jay-Z's visit, the disjunctures between the stated purpose of promoting clean water, his concert, and the refusal to make himself more available led to criticisms of his lack of interest in the real Africa" (Shipley 271). As an effort aimed at bringing awareness of the water crisis to the younger MTV generation of Americans, the campaign likely succeeded. However, it illustrates the hazard of campaigning with diaspora celebrities in their home countries.

Many high profile celebrities are involved in philanthropic activities in their home countries. For example, China's Jackie Chan is reported to have donated more than $1.3 million in humanitarian aid, and Colombia's Shakira has been advocating for access to universal education through her nonprofit foundation, Pies Descalzos. However, if we are willing to look beyond high profile entertainers with global audiences and take time to query our cultural mentors about the people they admire, we may discover just the right empathy wire for our

message. For example, I recently had the opportunity to hold a focus group with university students from Central Asia who were in Seattle, Washington for a year long internship with local businesses through E2 Educational Services, a nonprofit organization supported by my local Rotary club. My question to the group was how to inspire philanthropy and social enterprise in the younger generation in Kazakhstan, Tajikistan and Kyrgystan. In the course of the conversation, the students began telling me about Ashkat Murzabayev, a Kazakhstani big data programmer who worked at Barclays and Twitter and donated the first $2 million he earned to The International Cancer Research Center. Aislu Morova, who is interning at Fikes Corporation, explained in her words, "His story is inspiring. When you look at him and what he did, it gives you hope. He is from Kazakhstan, he is successful, he shows it is possible" (Morova). Murzabayev has since founded Hip.kz, a startup that finds jobs for Kazahstanis with high potential to connect them with the best available job opportunities on the market ("Twenty-five"). Of his donation to cancer research, Murzabayev was quoted, "I admire people who dedicate their lives to cancer research. These people are so much stronger and braver than me. That's why I want to support them, especially since I see that science does not receive enough funding. Personally, I wanted to support financially the people who dedicate their lives to solving the global problem" ("Twenty-five"). While he may not be a famous global entertainer or a big-name Hollywood star, Marzabayev is most certainly a celebrity in his home country whose story of success and generosity strikes a chord that can resonate through that empathy wire with young people in Central Asia.

CHAPTER 8 —THE BUSINESS OF PHILANTHROPY OUTSIDE THE UNITED STATES

Drawing upon the research presented by editors Cagney and Ross in *Global Fundraising: How the World is Changing the Rules of Philanthropy* and articles by various researchers,

Chapter Eight provides an overview of corporate philanthropy and corporate social responsibility as it is being practiced in countries outside of the U.S. and western Europe as well as the role of wealthy business owners, venture capitalists, and social entrepreneurs in these countries. The purpose of Chapter Eight is twofold. First, it is meant to reinforce the warning presented in Section I, New Images of Philanthropy, that the rest of the world is redefining aid and philanthropy and adaptation is required to stay relevant. Second, it is meant to offer examples that spark creative thinking about how NGOs may increase partnership with the business sector.

CHAPTER 9 —EXPORTING EXPERTISE

As we examined in Chapter Eight, a wave of change agents from around the world are converging through corporate social responsibility, innovations in finance such as direct cash transfers and micro loans, and social enterprises. Most of these new models are designed to solve the root causes of suffering in a way that is sustainable and scalable. Still, philanthropy has its place in the mix and is adapting to this new environment by leveraging capital as well as talent and expertise in support of innovative approaches. In this chapter, we explore how organizations may go about the work of exporting philanthropic expertise. It starts with building trust and building capacity.

CROSS DRESSING IN SAUDI ARABIA–BUILDING TRUST AND CULTURAL MENTORS

The importance of understanding how business is done in various international contexts is undisputed. However, a cursory understanding of business protocol or ceremony is inadequate. We need to dive deeper to get at the root of certain behaviors if we are to understand them in context. For example, the Japanese are well known for being "all business" at meetings and then taking their potential business partners out for a long night of hard drinking. One may prepare oneself for this reality and stock up on Advil and seltzer water, but by not understanding *why* the

Japanese have this custom, one may miss an opportunity to forge a relationship. Trust is crucial in doing business. However, trust is earned in different ways and therefore triggers different types of behaviors to gain that trust. In *The Culture Map,* Erin Meyer identifies two types of trust, cognitive and affective. Cognitive trust is earned by demonstrating skill, accomplishment, and reliability. Showing competence is a way to earn cognitive trust. Affective trust is earned by demonstrating openness, empathy or friendship. Showing vulnerability is a way to earn affective trust. This is often confusing to Americans who perceive mixing emotion with business as unprofessional (Meyer 167-168).

For this reason, cultural brokers or mentors are invaluable in creating trust. David Schoultz, Global Program Leader of Drug Development, Devices and Tools at PATH in Seattle, Washington pointed out that "It is important to find people who span cultures and are comfortable everywhere, people who are bridges and can explain, 'this is how we think about it from our perspective'" (Schoultz). Schoultz, who formerly worked with the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, knows this subject well. On several occasions, he traveled to Saudi Arabia with a team from the Gates Foundation at the invitation of a Saudi family interested in the work of Bill and Melinda Gates. According to his teammate, Jennifer Alcorn, the Senior Program Officer of Innovative Donor Models at the Gates Foundation, the family they were working with was liberal by Saudi standards and had an interest in cultivating relationships and bringing groups around them who shared their way of thinking. The family hosted elaborate dinners with wonderful entertainment and on one of these occasions, Alcorn recalled, "We got David to wear a dress… so it was just kind of a fun evening of cross-dressing in Saudi Arabia" (Alcorn). Schoultz was willing to put himself in a vulnerable position to build affective trust and thereby strengthen an important relationship with a culture-spanning Saudi family, who may be called

upon to help future teams navigate the culture and perform its work in Saudi Arabia more effectively.

Building Philanthropic Capacity

Philanthropic organizations have an opportunity to elevate the skill with which philanthropy is practiced in developing and middle income countries, increasing its effectiveness and potential to offer long term solutions to problems in those communities. Headquartered in Seattle, Social Venture Partners International (SVPI) is a unique, almost franchise-style organization that provides a type of turn-key nonprofit or social enterprise opportunity for its partners. Partners pay a joining fee that provides a website, customer relationship management software, the use of and access to SVP branding for marketing materials, photos and stories for messaging, plus media relations and social media assistance. SVPI also provides members access to a network of more than 3,000 philanthropists and entrepreneurs in six countries, opening opportunities for collaboration on projects and the sharing of expertise ("Our Global Network"). SVPI currently operates in the United States, Korea, Japan, and India. Sarah Perry, the Chief Development Officer at SVPI, explained that "SVPI is about moving the dial collectively. We have a construct, a system you can adapt to your country. My job is to bring funds together to amplify what the SVPs are doing and look at the system across the global lens" (Perry). However, SVPI is offering far more than an online storefront with technology. They offer extensive training modules and consultants that teach partners how to recruit employees, attract donors, assess their organizational capacity, and evaluate impact with numerous surveys and tools that assess program effectiveness (Perry). Perry also specified that SVPI requires its partners to have a board, a mission statement, and a strategic plan. These are structures that may be unfamiliar in some parts of the world. In this way, entities such as SVPI are helping people

around the globe to become more skillful participants with the knowledge they need to effectively leverage philanthropy for the causes and people they care about most.

Supporting Social Entrepreneurs

In Chapter Eight we discussed how challenges to the lack of business capital are being addressed through innovative financing models. Lack of training in business management is an equal challenge. Providing a loan or equity funding to someone who does not possess the skills to run a business makes no sense, while an entrepreneur with good business skills who lacks adequate funds will not be able to grow or thrive either. We need to support both.

Eng Alfansus Mwangi, who goes by the name of Alfa, owns a security system installation company in Nairobi, Kenya. Alfa and I met on social media in 2015 through our shared interest in supporting the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals. In a Skype conversation, Alfa spoke to me about his aspirations as a business person and a job creator. While he aspires to offer regular employment in the future, at this point, Alfa hires help on a contract basis for installation jobs that are too large for him to do on his own. Creating these contract jobs, however, does make a valuable economic contribution that will lead to more as his business grows. In Alfa's words, "Even if I have not employed these guys, I'm happy for that period they are doing my contract jobs, they are able to put food on their tables… and as I regularly get jobs it encourages them to perform a notch higher so that clients refer us and bring us more work" (Mwangi). Alfa said he believes it is not only important to be a self made person, but to be thinking of others. In fact, he recently assisted a group of youth from the country to transition to living in the city by arranging for accommodations to allow them a softer landing and has participated in campaigns to promote youth education. Alfa reflected, "I have helped [people], maybe not very many, because I'm also still trying to get on my own feet. I can't say I am where I would want to be"

(Mwangi). While Alfa made no mention of wanting or needing assistance to run his business, I nonetheless became curious about what kind of support might be available for a young entrepreneur like Alfa.

Donna Rosa is an international business development consultant offering business advisory services and capacity development for micro, small, and medium enterprises in developing countries. Rosa has worked with numerous projects, mostly under contract with agencies such as USAID, throughout Africa as well as Russia, El Salvador, Haiti, and Kosovo. According to Rosa, an entrepreneur like Alfa would likely fall through the cracks due to the way aid programs currently operate. Rosa explained that if there were an aid program in Alfa's area, he would only be considered if his business met specific project criteria. Often projects are designed to support specific sectors such as agriculture, telecoms, sanitation, or women-owned businesses. Other programs run business plan competitions seeking innovation, the next big idea, and scalable high potential businesses that could have the greatest economic impact and create the most jobs. Alfa's enterprise would meet none of these criteria (Rosa). That is why Rosa is a strong advocate for change, through an approach she calls "Aidtrepreneurship." This approach prioritizes ongoing business support and long term mentoring. Rosa said that consultants are often brought in on a contract by an organization, like USAID or DfID, to do a specific task and are then sent home. This works if all that is needed is technical training. However, counseled Rosa, "Running a business is something else. Providing one-off training on how to write a business plan or basics of financial accounting is of limited value. Entrepreneurs need mentorship over time: a year at least. Otherwise, it's like handing a computer to someone who's never used one, showing them how to turn it on and work the keyboard, and then walking away" (Rosa).

What must be understood is that the vast majority of micro enterprise and small business owners are what Rosa calls "entrepreneurs of necessity." These are people who have to figure out how to sell something in order to survive due to such factors as rural location, inadequate education, and lack of available jobs. Entrepreneurs of necessity are overlooked by aid agency programs because their businesses generally do not meet specific project criteria or promise a specific return on investment for the agency. However, Rosa said supporting entrepreneurs of necessity allows parents to adequately feed families, send children to school, and perhaps save and invest in their businesses even if no additional jobs are created. Rosa stated, "Their lives are completely changed. These small solo enterprises should not be overlooked because we're seeking massive impact. We can alleviate poverty effectively one family at a time" (Rosa). That said, investing in entrepreneurs with bright, innovative ideas to create jobs and solve community problems on a larger scale usually offers a better return on investment for aid agencies and other organizations. These entrepreneurs may not be from the poorest segment of society, but they need help in starting and building their businesses. While they currently attract more financial support than people who are entrepreneurs of necessity, competition for aid is significant. Only a few selected businesses qualify, as people like Alfa and his security installation business in Nairobi illustrate.

Scrap the Old Way and Build a New System from the Ground Up

NGOs and development organizations seeking to shift from a traditional aid model to a model supporting entrepreneurs must first seek to understand the problems and needs entrepreneurs face in whatever country they are in. This may require on-the-ground research, talking to small business owners, and analyzing the local business environment. For assistance, NGOs can look to the private sector for both expertise as well as funding. Experienced business

people can help NGOs design programs that get results. Rosa said she has observed more government-NGO-private sector partnerships, and while this is a good thing, there are challenges in making partnerships work. The strength of aid agencies is the resources they can bring including government connections, funding, on-the-ground experience, the ability to enforce, and overall experience in the countries where they work. However, the bureaucracy associated with government aid programs may frustrate private sector business talent and drive them away from such partnerships. Rosa contended, "If businesses operated like government agencies they'd last about five minutes in the marketplace. Innovation is needed, including the willingness to scrap the old way of doing things and build a modern system from the ground up. That's a huge leap. Businesses pivot when things aren't working, but with bureaucracies it's like getting a walrus to run a marathon: they're not built for it" (Rosa). As Katie Willis describes it in *Theories and Practices of Development,* "Dependence on external aid assistance means that many projects are more likely to react to the requirements and preferred activities of the potential donors (NGOs, foreign governments and multilateral organizations) than local people" (2205-2206). Clearly, there is a need for adaptive, innovative thinking and private-public partnerships to address these issues. NGOs may consider responding with a startup mentality of their own by piloting new adaptive models for their aid programs.

Jennifer Alcorn of the Gates Foundation sees potential for growing both philanthropic and business expertise by opening small startup style offices in developing countries. These offices would need to employ local talent, whether on a paid or volunteer basis, to ensure that a deep understanding of both the culture and business climate is integrated directly into the model. NGOs and other philanthropic organizations may consider opening these startup or satellite offices simply to increase fundraising and brand awareness in countries that are graduating from

traditional aid. However, Alcorn cautioned that it would take a concerted effort, likely over a period of three to five years for such an enterprise to succeed. Alcorn counseled, "You have to determine that you want to put that effort into the cultivation of individuals and realize you will lose money for several years. After that, you determine success not only based on the funds raised, but the advocates you create through the fundraising, which is often just as valuable as their funding" (Alcorn).

Development organizations may consider banding together to run social enterprise incubators from satellite offices to save on costs. Veteran social entrepreneurs and authors Susan Davis and David Bornstein suggest that philanthropic organizations such as the Centre for Social Innovation and the MaRS Discovery District in Canada are effective models to launch successful social enterprises— much in the way business incubators or innovation hubs have been successful in launching many start up businesses (Bornstein and Davis 1626). These hubs provide access to facility resources, shared costs for common administrative or janitorial services, and often access to skill training and education. The beauty of creating start up hubs for social entrepreneurs is that not only do these types of hubs significantly reduce overhead costs, they also provide ample opportunities for collaboration and creativity, which is a value added to the enterprises involved. It is also a perfect opportunity to leverage philanthropic venture capital, designed to be a means of support for social enterprises in their early stages (1622).

While it is conceivable to open and operate this type of physical start up hub in remote locations, technical assistance may also be leveraged to maximize effectiveness, lower costs, and tap into social networks. For example, Social Venture Partners International also runs an affiliate Purpose Investor Network (PIN) that is built on the venture philanthropy or a venture capital model. The innovative idea in this model is that partners involved not only give their money, but

also time and talent. The network describes itself as part of a new impact investing movement that focuses on supporting both for-profit and nonprofit enterprises ("Mission"). These types of networks are making it possible for people to fund a broader range of social change agents, whether they are structured as a nonprofit or for-profit entity. These newer takes on traditional and venture style models are increasing the effectiveness of philanthropy by helping social entrepreneurs, who are creating sustainable solutions to social problems, to launch and grow their companies. These are models worth exploring for NGOs that aspire to be on the leading edge of social change.

CHAPTER 10 — EMPOWERING YOUTH PHILANTHROPY

Chapter Summary: Chapter Ten explores examples of young people who are bringing new ideas and energy to solving problems in their home countries. Interviews conducted with high school students in Afghanistan reveal efforts toward stopping child marriage, while students visiting the United States from Kazakhstan offer their perspective on what they appreciate and what they wish to change in their own culture. The importance of child voice and participation is highlighted to ensure that any NGO strategy includes this important demographic in their efforts to support philanthropy or fundraising in countries outside of the United States.

THE STORY BEHIND *BRAND AID FOR NGOS* - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND LITERATURE REVIEWS

The following section details the author's fieldwork and research that formed the basis of the book. It follows the initial questions that led to the identification of a gap in the literature and research with regard to communications strategies for successfully raising money and producing awareness campaigns in other countries. It traces the realization that the traditional aid model on the whole is in a process of redefining itself and that NGOs are in a unique position to leverage their knowledge and expertise if they are willing to adapt to new circumstances.

Research Methodology

My initial research focused on uncovering best practices by NGOs and nonprofit organizations in the development field to craft culturally relevant communications and social media campaigns to increase awareness of social causes and raise funds from audiences outside of the United States and Europe. I conducted this initial research through participatory fieldwork for the African Diaspora United for Development (ADUD) in Washington, D.C.; Yardimlasma ve Dayanisma Vakfi (YDV) located in Istanbul, Turkey; and The American School at The Hague (ASH) in Den Haag, Netherlands. Personal interviews were conducted with communications professionals and executives from NGOs, including the World Resources Institute (WRI), Global Impact, Pyxera Global, Devex, and the International Refugee Committee (IRC). As noted by the late anthropologist Harry F. Wolcott, "Firsthand experience through participant observation is both the starting point and the filter through which everything else is screened as we make sense of all that we have observed" (Wolcott 655). This was my primary research strategy at ADUD and YDV.

The fieldwork on behalf of ADUD, which had been in operation for less than a year at the time, was conducted over a six month period in 2016 and involved working with the organization to develop a strategic communications plan to publicize and launch one of its new programs assisting new African immigrants to navigate life in a new country and culture. The fieldwork took an Action Research approach involving collaboration and direct interaction with the CEO and board members as a team. I was the sole American-born person on this team. Over time, the scope of the fieldwork grew beyond creating materials to appeal to the African Diaspora population in Washington, D.C. I conducted a 5-D—define, discover, dream, design and deliver—Appreciative Inquiry exercise with the board as described by Sue Annis Hammond in *The Thin Book of Appreciative Inquiry* (22). With the help of two ICD program classmates, I also produced a theory of change document to guide the advancement of one of their programs. I developed a close working relationship with the CEO and appreciated his guidance in choosing the most appropriate words and images for a campaign meant to appeal to an African audience.

A planned visit to work with the YDV in Instanbul, Turkey was preempted by the June 28, 2016 bombing at the Ataturk Airport and the failed attempted coup of President Erdogan on July 15, 2016. However, fieldwork was conducted remotely by Skype and emails in collaboration with the organization's founder. The YDV was seeking to obtain grants and increase contributions for their programs providing Syrian refugees in the city with milk, food, clothing and other services. Again, taking a participatory approach, my fieldwork consisted of assisting in the graphic design and development of a logo for the foundation. This active involvement offered me an opportunity to directly experience creating marketing materials for an audience outside of the United States.

In contrast, my approach to gathering research at the American School at the Hauge (ASH) was non-participatory, observational, and included more formal interviews. Conducted over a five day period in Den Haag, the fieldwork included a site visit to the school, dinner with an ASH diplomat family, as well as personal interviews with school personnel and parents. The primary goal was to learn about ASH's communications and messaging strategies to understand how they addressed the needs of a culturally and economically diverse set of students and parents new to living in the Netherlands.

The results of this initial research, as will be discussed in the findings section, brought to light a new set of questions that formed the basis of this thesis, necessitating a new round of research. This second round of qualitative research included interviews with professionals at the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, Social Venture Partners International, and the Walton Family Foundation. As a member of Rotary International, I led a learning and discovery session with a group of nine students from Kazakhstan involved in a leadership exchange program sponsored by the Rotary Club of Issaquah, Washington. A Skype interview was arranged with two Afghani directors with the Afghan Youth Connect project in Jalalabad, Afghanistan that is sponsored by a Rotary Club LaJolla, California. Additional personal interviews were conducted with practitioners in the field related to thesis topics.

Tertiary research included a thorough review of existing peer-reviewed literature and texts as well as internet searches for relevant online journal articles, news articles, stories, and blog posts. Of particular note, the groundbreaking work of Penelope Cagney and Philip Ross, authors of *Global Fundraising, How the World is Changing the Rules of Philanthropy* and Dawn Burton, author of *Cross-Cultural Marketing, Theory, Practice, and Relevance,* has provided a base of research in this relatively new line of inquiry.

Findings

In the process of collaborating with the African Diaspora United for Development to develop a communications campaign with messaging targeted to African migrants to the United States, a major challenge expressed by their CEO was the African view of charity. As Lima stated, "It's hard for African people to help each other, especially here. I'm not sure why, but the mentality back home is being overly cautious in getting involved in people's business" (Lima). And yet, here was a person from Africa attempting to grow a network of people to volunteer and donate to help other Africans. I heard similar criticism from Yardimlasma Dayanisma de Vakfi, a Christian foundation, that people were not accustomed to giving to charities and it was not part of the culture (Yildirim). Here was a person who is Turkish and Christian working to establish the ideals of solidarity between Turkish citizens and the Syrian refugees. In posing the question of how people view charity and philanthropy at home to the students from Kazakhstan, they explained that people in their country did not give readily and are generally skeptical or mistrustful about being asked for money. However, they were quick to tell me about a friend back in Kazakhstan, a recent university graduate who is seeking funding and volunteer hours from local business owners to support a nonprofit he started to help young people earn job skills. I interpreted each of these examples as evidence that the seeds of philanthropic ideals are very much present in each of these cultures and may be nurtured.

My fieldwork at the American School at The Hague revealed that their communications strategy was less focused on creating messaging that would resonate with people coming from a particular country or culture and more on acculturation. That said, their Communications Director explained that they are successful in their community building efforts because empathy is at the core of their approach. They are adept at anticipating the emotional and psychological

state of parents and students who are in an unfamiliar culture as well as being in an international school setting. A great deal of their effort is spent in face to face communication right from the start to help put people at ease. I did not meet with enough parents or conduct a survey to state unequivocally that their approach was successful. However, I was told they have a waiting list for entry even with competitors in the market and the parents I did interview had only positive things to say about the school culture.

In the course of interviewing the communications professionals and executives at NGOs regarding their practices to develop culturally relevant fundraising and awareness campaigns, I learned that with resources stretched thin, the fundraising focus was almost solely on growing their base in the United States. The Social Media Director at the World Resources Institute, Laura Dooley, explained that WRI has opened satellite offices because WRI recognizes the benefit of employing people who know how to navigate their own culture. However, this strategy comes with resource challenges for the people working in those satellite offices. Dooley explained that "They don't have many staff, so we are trying to figure out how to help them so they can take action. First, we are focusing on building the research staff and then building the communications staff. All of this is a challenge" (Dooley). I asked Marina Adese, the communications director at the International Refugee Committee, the same question about fundraising in other countries. She responded, "We don't produce content in different languages [other than English]. It's in our strategy and we hope to do it in the next few years, but it's not something that we do right now. We still try to make [our campaigns] as globally appealing as possible, while understanding our limitations, that our headquarters is in the U.S., we speak English, that we don't have the capacity for more languages and understanding cultural nuances" (Adese). That said, the second largest conglomerate of people following IRC on Facebook is in

Nairobi, Kenya (Adese). What I learned from these interviews is that at this point, resources are not being directed toward cross-cultural marketing or appeals to raise funds in countries outside the United States. From this I inferred that the model is still to raise money in North America or Europe to fund programs in developing countries. However, it is possible that we are beginning to see a shift in the tide. In July, 2016, Oxford-based Oxfam announced it will move its international headquarters to Nairobi in 2017-2018.

Literature Review

The following analysis of peer reviewed articles and publications explores the findings to date of researchers, social scientists and philanthropists, as well as business and marketing professionals, as they relate to potential avenues of growth and challenges to address with the novel approach of promoting philanthropy from within worldwide. The review is organized by the key topics of the business sector ethics and challenges, governance issues, personal and national motivations of philanthropy, the role of religion in philanthropy, international business and marketing best practices for reaching cross cultural audiences, democratizing and expanding our definition of philanthropy, and the role young people in developing countries may play in constructing their own narratives around attitudes toward charity and philanthropy.

The Business Sector, Corporate Social Responsibility, Ethics and Challenges

An important avenue in reaching potential wealthy donors in developing countries is through the business sector. Globally, businesses are incorporating Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) into their business plans. Corporate perceptions of CSR initiatives vary in different cultural and economic contexts. Valerie Priscilla Goby and Catherine Nickerson studied the changing perceptions of Muslim consumers in Dubai about CSR and its relationship to Islamic principles of philanthropy. The authors posit that most people in the Middle East connect

the concept of *zakat*, which relates to income redistribution, to CSR. However, the better the level of social service a country provides, the less CSR is viewed as philanthropy. Rather, CSR is seen as a method to achieve "more advanced environmental and economic objectives" or to promote the company (Goby and Nickerson 175). The caution is that approaching wealthy corporate executives with messaging drawn too heavily on religious concepts without economic benefit may not be convincing. NGOs "need to consider how, in economically robust Muslim countries, economic orientations… could be incorporated into CSR in parallel with Islamic principles of philanthropy" (177).

As we seek to build favor for corporate charitable giving and involvement among business leaders, it is important to be aware of the challenges they may face in actuating philanthropic initiatives. A case study of the Heineken Corporation in Sub-Saharan Africa by Katinka Van Cranenburgh and Daniel Arenas published in the *Journal of Business Ethics* addresses ethics and challenges in CSR due to weak governance. Studying the journey of the Heineken Africa Foundation as it attempted to execute a large endowment toward health care initiatives, the authors illustrate the difficulty in determining the line of responsibility between corporations and that of the government and state, "companies need to be careful not to overstep the mark" (Van Cranenburgh and Arenas 534). For example, corporations who take on philanthropic activities have the potential to influence and shape public policy, even though they have not been democratically elected to do so. This may prove a difficult dance as corporations are increasingly expected to shoulder responsibilities that elsewhere are seen as those of the state, especially in cases of weak governance and civil sectors. Therefore, an awareness of the political climate and understanding of the extent to which corporate efforts are appropriate or

expected is an important factor in approaching wealthy business leaders about building CSR or corporate philanthropy initiatives into their mission.

Governance Issues

Ineffective governance is another challenge to philanthropy. Fortunately, according to Derek Chollet and Lael Brainard, private philanthropists are finding ways to play a role in addressing weak governance. Chollet and Brainard write that "Private philanthropy… can provide the experts and technical assistance to help a new government move forward while training local civic servants to carry on after they leave" (32). Additionally, private philanthropy can build capacity in the areas of administration, research, and human capital. In other words, philanthropic organizations may shore up weak government agencies who may want to help their citizens, but lack human capital, technology, and administrative capability (33). NGOs may also be involved in providing assistance to ensure that positive results are obtained, thus increasing positive perception for doing private philanthropic work. The bottom line is that if corporate or private philanthropy is seen as ineffective, there will be no incentive for business leaders or wealthy individuals to participate.

Global Fundraising, edited by Penelope Cagney and Bernard Ross, surveyed experts on global innovations and trends in philanthropy and nonprofits operating in countries outside of North America and Europe. They identify seven global megatrends in philanthropy. These include an acknowledgement that wealth is not confined to the developed world, that innovations for fundraising are coming from outside of the U.S. and Europe, there is a rise in the number of indigenous NGOs and NPOs operating in the world, and that philanthropy thrives best when there are codified policies, structures, and regulations for nonprofit agencies in place (Cagney and Ross 1984). Philanthropy and fundraising from a wide span of countries is examined in great

depth by experts working in each country or region. This work is extremely detailed and offers much insight relevant to Western NGOs who wish to undertake fundraising in the countries they serve.

Personal and National Motivations

Communications, public relations, and marketing work for cultivating major donors requires recognition about what inspires an individual to give. Russ Alan Prince and Karen Maru File conducted a multi-year, four phase research study that resulted in the publication in 1990 of *The Seven Faces of Philanthropy.* While this study focuses on the intrinsic motivations of wealthy American donors, the values represented by each profile (the seven faces) do provide well studied portraits of donors that may be re-framed in relevant and meaningful ways regardless of cultural background. Several studies conducted in other countries provide additional context for increasing the attractiveness of philanthropy. For example, the role of social capital in philanthropy in Mexico was the subject of a quantitative and qualitative study and survey by Michael Layton and Alejandro Moreno. The authors' study revealed that Mexican nonprofits must compensate for being in a low trust culture by encouraging membership and a sense of group belonging. In other words, appealing to the personal motivation of belonging would be a useful strategy for an NGO promoting philanthropy in Mexico.

Interesting storylines regarding African philanthropy are appearing on numerous African business websites and journals. Ventures Africa recently profiled Aliko Dagote, Africa's richest man, who has spent $185 million on philanthropic spending in the past two years. The Investment Climate Facility for Africa published an article online entitled "Philanthropy in Africa – a Changing Narrative" that speaks to the value of "uplifting Africa from within, giving clout to a new Africa that is rising" ("News"). Emily Janson's article "The Business Leaders

Behind the Foundations: Understanding India's Emerging Philanthropists" focuses on the growth of high net worth business leaders in India, inequality divides, and pressures for redistribution of wealth in that country. Through qualitative research conducted via interviews, Jansons reveals varying contexts for philanthropy, noting "in India philanthropy is particularly shaped by religion, culture, and regulations. Among India's top business leaders, religious giving remains a private affair, while the secular, structured giving through modern foundations is done with fanfare" (992). These studies point to the importance of adding the layer of cultural context when seeking to understand the motivations of a potential donor or philanthropist.

The Role of Religion in Philanthropy

Most world religions call on their adherents to serve others. NGOs that work with local religious associations have an opportunity to connect to faith based communities to encourage giving as a secular or societal value as well. Some of the world's poorest nations have the highest proportion of religious people (Gallup). Understanding how religious values relate to attitudes toward charitable organizations in these countries is important. Denni Arli and Hari Lasmono contend in their article for the *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing* that philanthropy is an integral part of almost all religions. Their study, conducted in Indonesia, analyzed intrinsic and extrinsic religiosity with attitudes towards helping others and volunteering. An interesting finding was the tendency to focus on helping people from within one's own congregation and then perhaps help others when they have leftover resources. The authors note this "may have implications for religious leaders to encourage members to donate and volunteer beyond their own religious walls in order to make more contributions to their community" (39). It is important for an NGO team to understand how some of the messages delivered by religious leaders affect how their organization is viewed. Another finding important

for an NGO to consider is the impact of promoting extrinsic reward as opposed to appealing to intrinsic motivations for volunteering. An extrinsic reward, for example, is giving as a means of getting ahead in one's career or networking. Arli and Lasmo state that "In the context of Indonesia, promoting volunteering work as a way to help people develop skills, expand networks and gain career-related experience may not be as affective (sic) as promoting volunteering as an altruistic act that benefits others" (Arli and Lasmno 48). When working with faith based communities, NGOs still need to do some groundwork to discover what motivates giving and volunteering in the local religious context in order to develop effective messages.

Researchers Flanigan, Asal, and Brown examined a number of factors, including religion, that engage political associations in the Middle East and North Africa in philanthropy in their study for the International Society for Third Sector Research. The authors identify *zakat*, an obligatory charitable contribution of 2.5% of one's income, a primary means of funding for Muslim charities, as an example of charity embedded in religious practices (Flanigan et al. 1789). John Huebler of Michigan State University puts that figure at 20%, but also adds that Islam encourages discretion in personal philanthropy, teaching that "one performs such acts for oneself and for God, rather than for public praise or personal advantage" (Huebler). In the *Journal of Community Psychology*, authors Amer, El-Sayeh, Fayad and Khoury, studied the role of psychology in addressing poverty and political violence in Egypt and Lebanon. The authors point out that concepts of what "community" means should not be assumed, and we should look for understanding with regard to a society's collectivism. For example, the Arabic word for community, *mojtama,* also refers to society. However, if we are trying to develop the idea of giving to the community in the sense Western minds relate to, we need to understand that family is of central value to Arab culture and religion is embedded in communal life (Amer et al. 58).

From this, communications professionals could infer that messages that speak to philanthropy for the "greater good" would be less meaningful than messages that speak to doing God's will or strengthening the family in this particular culture.

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS AND MARKETING BEST PRACTICES REACHING CROSS-CULTURAL AUDIENCES

Creating culturally relevant messaging, as with all communications efforts, requires an understanding of the audience to ensure the messages are meaningful to them. It some cases, it requires face-to-face and interpersonal communications to learn what people in unfamiliar cultures value and the words and symbols they use to describe those values. In the international business world, personnel sent to work in unfamiliar countries often struggle with adapting their behavior such that they can develop these personal contacts. In *Global Dexterity: How to Adapt Your Behavior Across Cultures without Losing Yourself in the Process,* Andy Molinsky offers practical advice gleaned from decades of research to operate effectively in unfamiliar cultural environments. Molinsky advises his readers to carefully seek out a cultural mentor to provide helpful advice and feedback to improve cross-cultural skills, as well as encourage feedback and guidance about the psychological and emotional side of cultural adaptation (Molinsky 1901). Becoming more comfortable operating in a foreign culture is likely to increase the effectiveness of doing the communications research work necessary to develop messaging that hits the target. Cultural mentors are essential to the process of understanding the audience and interpreting ideas in order to market those ideas in a compelling and meaningful way.

In *A Corporate Solution to Global Poverty,* authors George Lodge and Craig Wilson address how multinational corporations are responding to negative attitudes toward globalization as well as pressure from the international community to contribute more effectively to social

improvements (71). A common attitude is that multinational corporations are the bad guys who do not live up to their potential to be a progressive element in society. To whatever degree this is true, multi-national corporations know they have an image problem. This is certainly true of many NGOs as well. Lodge and Wilson's work highlights responses, such as the creation of an "International Development Architecture" to provide a set of guiding social principles and create legitimacy that may help these businesses not only live up to their potential, but gain more trust from citizens as the positive effects of their actions become evident in their results (Lodge and Wilson 71).

Dawn Burton's well researched book *Cross-Cultural Marketing, Theory, Practice, and Relevance* provides an in depth analysis of cross-cultural marketing. Self-reflection and understanding one's own cultural context at both the individual and organizational level is absolutely critical before we even begin to explore marketing strategies. Burton's first chapter is devoted to dimensions of culture, as well as discussion of the history of racism, to help the reader frame his or her own cultural identity. In the "Promotional Strategies" chapter, Burton assesses historical depictions of the 'other' in advertising images as a way of understanding the role of colonialism and post colonialism in marketing discourse (Burton 97-98). For NGOs working on communications strategies in developing countries, understanding how images and symbols are interpreted is of great importance. Burton also explores consumer behavior, marketing research, and management practices, all of which are applicable to promoting the idea of philanthropy. Social Marketing is another area of focus that figures more prominently when promoting a certain behavior as opposed to a product or idea. An article by Ling, Franklin, Lindsteadt, and Gearon entitled *Social Marketing: Its Place in Public Health,* reviews the history of social marketing in public health from public service announcements to social media. The authors

studied social marketing of public health initiatives from developing countries and concluded that they were most effective with face-to-face dialogue or interpersonal interaction (Ling et. al 251). While Western NGOs have all of the wonderful technology and tools of mass communication as support, this study's conclusions about changing behavior in public health in developing countries point to the need to consider incorporating face-to-face strategies in their marketing efforts.

DEMOCRATIZING AND EXPANDING OUR DEFINITION OF PHILANTHROPY

The W.K. Kellogg Foundation published a report entitled "Cultures of Giving" that challenges the image of philanthropy as photos of billionaires kneeling with children in poor countries and asks, "What if instead, the word 'philanthropy' also conjured images of Hmong women in Minnesota meeting to discuss where to direct their giving circle's next grant?" (Cultures 2). This extensive report of the philanthropic activities of diaspora and diverse communities includes profiles of Asian American and Pacific Islanders in San Francisco, an Arabic Community Center in Michigan, a Hispanic Federation in New York, the Hopi Foundation in Arizona, and the Associated Black Charities of Maryland. This report offers the insight that while philanthropy has been practiced by "communities of color," it is not acknowledged or defined by those communities as philanthropy (Cultures 12). An NGO working to foster philanthropy may therefore need to do some work to connect the term with cultural practices already in place within a society. Importantly, this report also showcases the power of storytelling. Each of the profiles included in the report tells the story of an individual or organization as a means of exemplifying the concept of "identity-based philanthropy" about which the report is based.

The Migration Policy Institute's report "Diaspora Philanthropy: Private Giving and Public Policy" covers the emergence of new development actors within the changing landscape of global aid as well as issues such as lack of trust in the voluntary and nonprofit sector. However, the bulk of the report addresses structural and policy impacts on private philanthropy in diaspora communities. The report concludes with recommended policy options for the United States to help build capacity for diaspora donors, including tax incentives, technical support, and incentive funds for innovation (Newland et al. 24-25). Angela Eikenberry's research on giving circles, particularly in the United States, but also in other countries, broadens the view of the idea of democratizing philanthropy beyond a simple definition of offering more choices and opportunities to give. Her studies highlight a trend taking place in society toward social bonding, and "linking citizens to one another across social and economic differences" (Eikenberry 47). Giving circles are an example of informal, voluntary associations growing in popularity, particularly among people "new" to the idea of philanthropy (84). These more informal associations, such as giving circles may "bring more diverse groups to the philanthropic table and influence members to be more strategic and committed" (105). Building on development strategies employed by NGOs, such a "Citizen Voice" and "Action and Asset Based Community Development," facilitating giving circles may offer a way for NGOs to introduce people to the concept of charitable giving in a new way that focuses on voluntary participation and civic engagement.

THE ROLE OF YOUNG PEOPLE IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

According to the Coalition of Community Foundations for Youth (CCFY), "Youth Philanthropy, as a means of mobilizing society's assets for the betterment of all, is enhanced by providing authentic opportunities for youth voice and influence" (Garza and Stevens 1). In a

2002 report, the CCFY advises that successfully engaging youth in philanthropy requires building structure and capacity, building skills and knowledge, and connecting to the community. Volunteer programs often provide such avenues for young people to participate in a culture of giving. However, existing structures and attitudes toward youth volunteering vary throughout the world. Of note, the Brookings Institute pointed to a 2007 Gallup poll that asked Middle Eastern youth if they had volunteered their time for an organization in the past month. Only 11% had, the report stated, because "youth and their families have no incentives to invest in volunteerism; neither public nor private sector jobs value these experiences… and universities base their decisions on nothing but national rankings on standardized testing" (Dhillon). As youth in the Middle East and other developing nations struggle for better education and wait for jobs, NGOs may look for a communications strategy focused on increasing the social incentives for youth involved in volunteer activities as well as investing in programs that help build structure and capacity.

Robert A. Opoku examined what motivates charitable giving among female and male college students in Saudi Arabia, a predominantly Islamic country, in an article written for the *International Journal of Nonprofit Volunteering*. Opoku conducted a survey, developed with the help of students in a marketing research class at a Saudi University, that was conducted in several major Saudi cities to determine preferences for giving to various causes. A deliberate effort was made to include female responses by asking female instructors at women's universities to distribute the survey to their female students, providing a voice that is often missing in the Middle East. His findings show that the young adults who responded prefer to donate to poor people (35%) followed by orphan care at 13.6% (177). However, female respondents chose these two by a large margin over their male counterparts. Young men, on the

other hand seemed more interested in giving to building projects, be they mosques or educational facilities. Opoku sees an opportunity in gender-based segmentation for promoting charities in cultures where high gender inequality exists. NGO communications strategies should not neglect to include research on gender differences when developing messaging to reach young male and female donors.

Nurturing philanthropy among young people in other countries without a doubt would require considerable resources and planning on the part of the NGO. However, Karen Tice, who discusses the role of organizations in fostering youth philanthropy in her book *New Directions for Philanthropic Fundraising* provides an incentive for this investment. She contends that there is a "huge generational transfer of wealth on the horizon" and that with this changing landscape "youth have an opportunity to shape the field and make a significant difference" (Tice 17). Further, according to Euromonitor, in 2012, 89.7% of the global population below the age of 30 lived in emerging and developing economies ("Special Report"). Given these demographics and the opportunities they present to cultivate a new generation of donors worldwide, NGOS would do well to focus efforts on developing philanthropic values among the younger generations in the countries they serve.

While many challenges exist, the literature illustrates that NGOs in the development field have multiple avenues of approach to promote the values of philanthropy with a goal of empowering people to solve social problems within their own countries rather than relying on donations from the West. Teams working on the ground have a unique opportunity to study the motivations and ideals and tenets of the people in the countries in which they work in order to communicate these ideas in a culturally relevant and meaningful way. NGOs experienced with policy matters have an additional opportunity to assist in the development of the governance

structures that may be lacking and impeding philanthropic efforts in a certain country or state. Should there be any hesitation on the part of NGOs to devote resources to this, the work of Cagney and Ross, in particular, provides evidence that fundraising and philanthropy are no longer the prerogative of North America and Europe, as countries as diverse as Brazil, Kenya, Ethiopia, and India are successfully forging their own philanthropic paths. To remain relevant in this time of globalization with shifting resources and power, NGOs would do well to consider new approaches to resource development to complete their missions. The literature has provided insight on how this may be accomplished and a foundation of research to build upon.

Conclusions:

Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) based in the United States and Europe have an opportunity to advance their missions by expanding their fundraising and communications efforts in the countries they serve. There are promising efforts underway by people in economically disadvantaged and middle income countries that show clearly the desire to advance and expand altruistic and philanthropic ideals into the mainstream. By adapting and modifying messaging aimed to appeal to Western hearts and minds in cross-culturally relevant ways, NGOs may strengthen the values of philanthropy outside of their home countries. In doing so, these organizations may develop new sources of revenue as well as talent. Opportunities exist to pivot from traditional aid to supporting private, corporate, and social enterprises through technical expertise and helping countries overcome weak governance issues.

These opportunities require Western NGOs to think beyond the customary strategy of developing fundraising and awareness campaigns aimed at gathering support and revenue from their home countries that is then delivered to the program countries. Rather, more campaigns should be designed to raise money as well as empower and strengthen philanthropy and its

acceptance in the mainstream of life within those countries. This is a challenging prospect as resources are already limited and many NGOs are obliged to keep administrative overhead as low as possible. That said, the waning of Western dominance in the world economy, the emergence of middle income countries, and slashed aid budgets may make some form of this strategy a more appealing investment. Most compelling, however, is the opportunity at hand for NGOs to elevate and infuse philanthropic values across public and private sectors worldwide and unleash a powerful force for social change.

WORKS CITED

Adese, Marina. Personal Interview. 09 Aug. 2016.

Alcorn, Jennifer. Personal Interview. 15 Dec. 2016

Andrew Lindridge. "Cross-Cultural Marketing, Theory, Practice and Relevance." *Journal of Marketing Management* 30. (2014):13-14. Print.

Amer, Mona M., et al. "Community Psychology and Civil Society: Opportunities for Growth in Egypt and Lebanon." *Journal of Community Psychology* 43.1. (2015):50-62. Print.

Arli, Denni and Hari Lasmono. "Are Religious People More Caring? Exploring the Impact of Religiosity on Charitable Organizations in a Developing Country." *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing* 20.1. (2015):38-51. Print.

Aslia, Laura. Personal Interview. 12 Aug. 2016.

Beck, Richard. *Unclean: Meditations on Purity, Hospitality, and Mortality*. Cascade Books, 2011. Kindle File.

Birdsall, Nancy. "The Global Financial Crisis: The Beginning of the End of the Development Agenda." *Center For Global Development* N.p., 20 Apr. 2012. Web. 16 Nov. 2016.

Bornstein, David and Susan Davis. *Social Entrepreneurship: What Everyone Needs to Know*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010. Kindle File.

Brainard, Lael and Derek H. Chollet. *Global Development 2.0: Can Philanthropists, the Public, and the Poor Make Poverty History?* Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institute Press, 2008.

Burton, Dawn. *Cross-Cultural Marketing: Theory, Practice and Relevance*. Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2009. Kindle File.

Cagney, Penelope and Bernard Ross. *Global Fundraising: How the World is Changing the Rules of Philanthropy*. Somerset: Wiley, 2013. Kindle File.

"Challenges and Trends in Private Social Investment and Philanthropy in Colombia." *Alliance Magazine*. 15 Oct. 2014. Web. 17 Feb. 2017.

Cluff, Angela and Paula Guillet de Monthoux. "Major Donors." *Global Fundraising: How the World is Changing the Rules of Philanthropy.* Eds. Cagney and Ross. John Wiley and Sons, Inc, 2013. Locations 6023-6399. Kindle File.

"Community Philanthropy Can Shift Power to Local Communities." *Africa Philanthropy Network*. N.p., n.d. Web. 26 Jan. 2017.

Cultures of Giving: Energizing and Expanding Philanthropy by and for Communities of Color. Rep. W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 2012. Print.

Dhillon, Navtej. "Middle East Bulge: Challenge or Opportunity?" *Brookings Institute*. 22 May 2008. Web. 22 Oct. 2016.

Dooley, Laura. Personal Interview. 25 July 2016.

"Donors: Keep out." *The Economist*. The Economist Newspaper. 12 Sept. 2014. Web. 25 Jan. 2017.

Eikenberry, Angela M. *Giving Circles: Philanthropy, Voluntary Association, and Democracy.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009. E-book.

Estevez, Dolia. "Mexican Billionaire Carlos Slim's Philanthropic Generosity Gets the Nod From a Kennedy Scion" *Forbes.* Forbes Magazine. 16 Oct. 2013. Web. 13 Feb 2017.

"European Nieghbors' Day". *European Federation of Local Solidarity*. N.p., n.d. Web. 24 Jan. 2017.

Flanigan, Shawn, et al. "Community Service Provision by Political Associations Representing Minorities in the Middle East And North Africa." *Voluntas: International Journal Of Voluntary Nonprofit Organizations* 26.5. 2015. Web. 20 Oct. 2016.

Gallup, Inc. "Religiosity Highest in World's Poorest Nations." *Gallup.com.* N.p., 31 Aug. 2010. Web. 07 Nov. 2016.

Garza, Pam and Pam Stevens. "Best Practices in Youth Philanthropy" *Coalitions of Community Foundations for Youth* (2002):1-48. Print.

Goby, Valerie Priscilla and Catherine Nickerson. "Conceptualization of CSR among Muslim Consumers in Dubai: Evolving from Philanthropy to Ethical and Economic Orientations." *Journal of Business Ethics* 136.1. (2016):175-177. Print.

GRASP. "Global Romanian Society of Young Professionals seeks NGO partnership." *GRASP* N.p.n.d. Web. 29 Jan. 2017.

Hammond, Sue Annis. *The Thin Book of Appreciative Inquiry.* 3rd ed.Thin Book Publishing Company, 2013. Kindle File.

Hofstede, Geert, et al. *Cultures and Organizations: Software of the Mind.* 3rd ed. McGraw-Hill Education, 2010. Kindle File.

"How U.S. Philanthropy is Inspiring Foreigners to Give" *The Atlantic*. Atlantic Media Company, n.d. Web. 07 Oct. 2016.

Huebler, John. "Diversity Essay: Philanthropy as a Tenet of Islam." Michigan State University Development. Resource Center. N.p., n.d. Web. 27 Oct. 2016

Ibrahim, Barbara Lethem. "Wealth and Giving in the Arab Region." *Middle East Institute.* 13 Oct. 2015. Web. 20 Jan. 2017.

Jansons, Emily. "The Business Leaders Behind the Foundations: Understanding India's Emerging Philanthropists." *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary Nonprofit Organizations* 26.3. (2014):1-24. Print.

"Jay-Z: Charity Work & Causes." *Look to the Stars*. N.p.n.d. Web. 22 Feb. 2017.

Joyaux, Simone P. *Strategic Fund Development + Website: Building Profitable Relationships That Last*. 3rd Ed. John Wiley and Sons, Inc. 2013. Kindle File.

Laughlin, Kirk. "Is Carlos Slim Really Committed to Corporate Social Responsibility?" *Nearshore Americas*. N.p., 09 Feb. 2010. Web. 21 Mar. 2017.

Layton, Michael D. and Alejandro Moreno. "Philanthropy and Social Capital in Mexico." *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing* 19.3. (2014):1-12. Print.

Lima, Juve. Personal Interview. 04 Apr. 2016.

Ling, Jack C., et al. "Social Marketing: Its Place in Public Health."*Annual Review of Public Health* (1992):1-17. Print.

Lodge, George and Craig Wilson. *A Corporate Solution to Global Poverty: How Multinationals Can Help the Poor and Invigorate Their Own Legitimacy.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016. Print.

Meyer, Erin. *The Culture Map: Breaking Through the Invisible Boundaries of Global Business Public Affairs*. Perseus Books Group, 2014. Kindle File.

Myers, Bryant L. *Walking with the Poor: Principals of Transformational Development*. Orbis Books, 2011. Kindle File.

Miller, Kiri Leroux. *Content Marketing for Nonprofits: A Communications Map for Engaging Your Community, Becoming a Favorite Cause, and Raising More Money.* John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 2013. Kindle File.

"Mission." *Purpose Investor Network.* N.p., n.d. Web. 11 Feb. 2017.

Moe-Lobeda, Cynthia D. *Resisting Structural Evil: Love as Ecological-Economic Vocation* Fortress Press, 2013. Kindle File.

Molinsky, Andy. *Global Dexterity: How to Adapt Your Behavior across Cultures without Losing Yourself in the Process*. Harvard Business Review Press, 2013. Kindle File.

Moorhead, Joanna and Joe Sandler Clarke. "Big NGOs Prepare to Move South, but Will it Make a Difference?" *The Guardian*. Guardian News and Media. 16 Nov. 2015. Web. 18 Nov. 2016.

Morova, Aisulu. Focus Group Participant. 19 Nov. 2016.

Mwangi, Alfansus Eng. Personal Interview. 04 Dec. 2016.

Newland, Kathleen, et al. "Diaspora Philanthropy: Private Giving and Public Policy." *Migration Policy Institute* Sept. (2010):1-36. Print.

"News." Philanthropy in Africa – a Changing Narrative. *The Investment Climate Facility for Africa.* N.d. Web. 25 Oct. 2016.

Oh, Kongdan. "Korea's Path from Poverty to Philanthropy." *Brookings Institute*. 14 June 2014. Web. 31 Jan. 2017.

Opoku, Robert A. "Examining the Motivational Factors Behind Charitable Giving Among Young People in a Prominent Islamic Country." *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing* 18.3. (2013):173-186. Print.

"Our Global Network." *Social Venture Partners*. N.p., n.d. Web. 07 Feb. 2017.

Perry, Sarah. Personal Interview. 11 Jan. 2017

Prince, Russ Alan and Karen Maru File. *The Seven Faces of Philanthropy.* John Wiley and Sons. San Francisco, CA, 1994. Print.

Randazzo, Crystaline. Personal Interview. 14 Sept. 2016.

Rosa, Donna M. Personal Interview. 27 Feb. 2017.

Schwartz, Felicia. "Trump Seeks Major Cut to State Dept., USAID." *The Wall Street Journal*. Dow Jones & Company. 16 Mar. 2017. Web. 19 Mar. 2017.

Shoultz, David. Personal Interview. 21 Nov. 2016.

Shipley, Jesse Weaver. *Living the Hiplife: Celebrity and Entrepreneurship in Ghanian Popular Music*. Duke University Press, 2013. E-book.

Sizing the Field – Frameworks for a New Narrative of African Philanthropy. Rep. African Grantmakers Network, Apr. 2013. Web. 27 Oct. 2016.

"Special Report: The World's Youngest Populations." *Euromonitor International Blog Special Report The Worlds Youngest Populations*. Comments. N.p. 30 Sept. 2015. Web. 22 Oct. 2016.

"Ten Things You (Probably) Didn't Know About Philanthropy in Latin America." The Relationship Between Money & Mission: Understanding ROI in Philanthropy & Social Investment (Part 4). *Philanthropy Impact*. N.p., n.d. Web. 17 Feb. 2017.

Tice, Karin E. "Engaging Youth in Philanthropy." *New Directions for Philanthropic Fundraising*. Wiley, 2002. Print.

"Twenty-Five Year Old Kazakhstani Programmer Donates $2 Million for Cancer Research - People | Tengrinews." *Tengrinews*.kz. N.p., 22 July 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2017.

Umuhuzuma, Carine. Personal Interview. 25 July 2016.

Urlaub, Julie. Personal Interview. 23 June 2016.

Van Cranenburgh K.C. and D. Arenas. "Strategic and Moral Dilemmas of Corporate Philanthropy in Developing Countries: Heineken in Sub-Saharan Africa." *Journal of Business Ethics* 122.3. (2014):523-536. Print.

Velez, Ryan. "Carlos Slim: Success and Controversy of the Once-Richest Man on Earth." *Tharawat Magazine*. N.p., 06 Feb. 2017. Web. 21 Mar. 2017.

Willis, Katie. *Theories and Practices of Development: Volume 8*. Routledge Perspectives on Development. Taylor and Francis, 2011. Kindle File.

Wolcott, Harry F. *Ethnography: A Way of Seeing*. Altamira Press, 1999. Kindle File.

Yildirum, Mine. Email and Skype conversations with author. 25 July 2016 to 01 Aug. 2017.